

AGENDA

Meeting of the Personnel Committee of the Capital Area Regional Planning Commission

June 10, 2010

City-County Building Rm 315, 210 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd., Madison WI

5:45 p.m.

Notice is hereby given that due to common membership, a majority of the Executive Committee of the Capital Area Regional Planning Commission is expected to be present at this meeting. This constitutes a meeting of the Executive Committee pursuant to State ex rel. Badke V. Greendale Village Board., 173 Wis 2d 553, 494 N.W. 2d 408 (1993) and must be noticed as such although the Executive Committee will not take any formal action at this meeting.

All CARPC Commissioners may attend this meeting, and a quorum of the full CARPC may be present. It is intended that actions at this meeting will be voted on by only those Personnel Committee members present.

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of minutes of the meeting of May 13, 2010
3. Consideration of recommending a revised CARPC Salary Schedule
4. Consideration of recommending that CARPC make an offer of employment to fill the vacant Senior Planner position
5. Adjournment

If you need a sign language interpreter, materials in alternate formats, or other accommodations to access this meeting, please contact CARPC staff at 266-4137, or TDD 266-4529, at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

MINUTES

Meeting of the Personnel Committee of the Capital Area Regional Planning Commission

May 13, 2010

City-County Building Rm 315, 210 MLK Jr. Blvd., Madison WI

5:00 p.m.

Present: Martha Gibson, Larry Palm, Kurt Sonnentag, Phil Van Kampen

Absent: None

Others Present: Chris Gjestson, Kamran Mesbah, Attorney John St. Peter

1. Roll Call

Mr. Palm took the chair. The meeting was called to order at 5:02 p.m.; roll was recorded.

2. Approval of minutes of the meeting of April 8, 2010

Moved by Mr. Van Kampen, seconded by Mr. Sonnentag, to approve the minutes of the meeting of January 14, 2010. Motion carried.

3. Consideration of a motion to convene into closed session pursuant to Wis. Stat. 19.85(1)(c) for considering employment, promotion, compensation or performance evaluation data of any public employee over which the governmental body has jurisdiction or exercises responsibility, so that CARPC staff may discuss personnel matters with the Personnel Committee. The meeting will reconvene into open session immediately following the closed session.

Mr. Palm read the agenda item language; Moved by Mr. Sonnentag, seconded by Ms. Gibson, to convene into closed session pursuant to the language of the agenda item. Motion carried unanimously on roll call vote. The meeting convened into closed session.

4. Reconvene into open session for discussion and possible action regarding the closed session item

Moved by Ms. Gibson, seconded by Mr. Sonnentag, to re-convene into open session. Motion carried unanimously. No action was necessary.

5. Adjournment

Moved by Ms. Gibson, seconded by Mr. Van Kampen, to adjourn; motion carried at 5:44 p.m.

Recorded by Chris Gjestson

Background

The current CARPC pay schedule is based on that of the dissolved Dane County RPC, which was historically based on the Dane County pay schedule (the RPC receives most of its funding through the Dane County property tax levy). Concurrent to making employment offers in December 2007, the Commission elected to conduct a salary study at a later date to ensure internal and external pay equity.

In 2008, Enetrix LLC (formerly Carlson Dettmann Inc.) was contracted to conduct a salary study; Katie McCloskey was the chief consultant for the project.

The salary study indicated that the current pay for CARPC employees was on average about 102% of “market”, which had been identified by Ms. McCloskey as other Wisconsin RPCs, City of Madison, and Dane County. She suggested that the current employee pay is “working” based on recruitment and retention. Ms. McCloskey further reported that CARPC annual merit step increases were about 5% while the “market” step increases were on average about 2.5%.

Based on Committee input, Ms. McCloskey prepared a draft schedule (“Study Schedule”) with the following features:

- 1) Four ranges for seven CARPC positions (did not include the Deputy Director/Division Director position);
- 2) each range included 10 step increases, provided annually for the first five years of employment and biennially from steps 6 (7 years longevity) to 10 (15 years longevity);
- 3) the hourly control rate, based on 100% of “market”, was at Step 5 (5 years longevity); and
- 4) step increases were in equal increments based on 2.5% of the control rate in each range.

The Committee expressed support for the basic structure of the Study Schedule, but indicated the need for pay rates which were more competitive with local agencies, such as Dane County and City of Madison.

Preliminary Draft Schedule

In response to Committee direction, staff prepared a preliminary Draft Schedule (attached) using guidelines provided by the Committee.

1. The Draft Schedule is simplified. Members agreed that the current schedule was too large given the small size of the agency, with an unnecessary number of salary ranges, and too inconsistent (some ranges included 11 increases, most others only 7). The Draft provides only 6 ranges, each with 17 annual step increases. As suggested by Ms. McCloskey, additional ranges can be added as needed (such as that for Division Director and/or Senior Environmental Engineer). The Deputy Director/Division Director position was not analyzed in the Study, but is proposed for inclusion in the Draft because it is currently filled.
2. Percentage of annual pay increases are decreased. Committee members agreed that increases over 5% in addition to COLA increases may be excessive; salaries should be increased in smaller increments which more closely resemble “market” increases identified in the study. For each of the 6 ranges, the Draft utilizes average increases of

1.32%, 1.32%, 1.79%, 2.70%, 2.73%, and 3.44% over 17 years (steps). For all ranges, the maximum percentage increases were reduced.

3. Junior Planner position (“Planner”) is placed in its own salary range with a reduced maximum. While the Study placed the Jr. Planner position with the GIS/Graphics Designer positions, which includes wage rates that matched Senior Planner rates, Committee members agreed that an employee hired as an entry-level Planner should not be “rewarded” for remaining a junior-level Planner. Successful Planners who excel in the position would preferably be promoted to Senior Planner after a reasonable period. The maximum rate for the Planner position is proposed to be similar to the entry rate for Senior Planner.
4. Annual pay increases are provided more evenly. The current structure provides a “bumpy” scale with both large and small increases over time; the Committee recommended a “smooth” scale. The Draft provides consistent annual increases which steadily decrease over time, without additional increases at longevity milestones (see attached charts).
5. Salaries are competitive with those of comparable positions in Dane County Planning. The “market” identified in the Study included all other Wisconsin RPCs; therefore, the wage rates of the Study lagged behind those of local agencies. Members agreed that in order for CARPC to remain competitive the “market” should be considered local public agencies, similar to cities in the county, Dane County or DNR. The Draft was developed by retaining the current CARPC minimum and maximum rates. In each case other than the Planner position the Draft maximum rate is slightly (<1%) less than the equivalent Dane County rate, as requested by the Committee. The salary ranges were determined by placing the median rate *before* Step 8 (of 17 total steps) in order to create a curved scale (using polynomial trendlines) which provides higher increases earlier in the scale, and lower increases later. This approach allows employees to reach the median salary in a reasonable time period, and is similar to that provided City of Madison and Dane County employees, although the Draft Schedule provides smoother ranges which utilize annual – not biennial – increases.

Impact on current staff. Implementing the Draft Schedule effective Jan. 1, 2011, assuming no change in the status of current staff, and assuming employees would be placed at the step which most closely matches - but not less than - that scheduled to be earned in 2011, the impact on the CARPC budget is negligible by increasing total salary paid by less than \$3,000. However, over the next three combined budget cycles, there is estimated to be a net reduction of about \$1,500. The following table summarizes the estimated impacts of adopting the Draft Schedule.

Position	Vs. Current Salary Schedule	
	2011	2011-2013 total
Administrative Services Manager	\$ 595.20	(\$ 1,337.60)
Planner	(89.60)	(2,731.20)
Graphic Designer	1,705.60	(284.80)
Environmental Engineer	(422.40)	518.40
Senior Community Planner	546.00	2,276.00
Senior Environmental Resources Planner	561.60	(6.40)
TOTAL	\$ 2,896.40	(\$ 1,565.60)

Salary Structure Comparison (2009)							
	MEDIAN	LOW	HIGH	YRS to HIGH	Avg Increment	Max % step increase	Avg % increase
Admin. Services Manager							
Study	22.90	20.04	25.76	15.0	0.38	2.84%	1.70%
Dane Co.	25.28	20.36	30.20	16.0	0.62	4.86%	2.51%
C. Madison (Program Assist. 3)	22.78	20.15	25.40	25.0	0.21	3.14%	0.94%
CARPC Current	24.80	19.51	30.09	17.0	0.62	7.45%	2.61%
Draft	24.80	19.51	30.09	17.0	0.62	5.13%	2.70%
Planner							
Study	22.90	20.04	25.76	15.0	0.38	2.84%	1.70%
Dane Co.	26.06	19.31	32.80	16.0	0.84	4.91%	3.38%
C. Madison (Planner 1)	26.88	23.19	30.58	25.0	0.30	4.44%	1.12%
CARPC Current	25.58	18.47	32.68	17.0	0.84	9.25%	3.46%
Draft	23.80	18.47	29.13	17.0	0.63	5.47%	2.73%
GIS Specialist, Graphic Designer							
Study	24.00	21.00	27.00	15.0	0.40	2.86%	1.70%
Dane Co.	26.06	19.31	32.80	16.0	0.84	4.91%	3.38%
C. Madison (Planning GIS Specialist)	28.02	24.08	31.95	25.0	0.31	4.98%	1.15%
CARPC Current	25.58	18.47	32.68	17.0	0.84	9.25%	3.46%
Draft	25.58	18.47	32.68	17.0	0.84	6.78%	3.44%
Senior Planners, Env. Engineer							
Study	32.00	28.00	36.00	15.0	0.53	2.86%	1.70%
Dane Co.	34.09	29.66	38.52	16.0	0.55	4.82%	1.67%
C. Madison (Planner 4, Engineer 4)	35.10	29.84	40.35	25.0	0.42	4.99%	1.23%
CARPC Current	33.38	28.40	38.35	17.0	0.59	8.02%	1.81%
Draft	33.38	28.40	38.35	17.0	0.59	5.21%	1.79%

DRAFT Salary Schedule: DISCUSSION SCENARIO #1

June 4, 2010

Hourly Rates (effective Jan. 1, 2011 through Dec. 31, 2011)

Rg	Applicable Positions	Step																	
		0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
5	Planner	18.47	19.48	20.44	21.35	22.21	23.03	23.80	24.52	25.19	25.82	26.40	26.93	27.41	27.85	28.24	28.58	28.87	29.13
7	Administrative Services Manager	19.51	20.51	21.46	22.37	23.22	24.04	24.80	25.52	26.18	26.81	27.38	27.91	28.39	28.82	29.21	29.55	29.84	30.09
10	GIS Specialist Graphic Designer	18.47	19.29	20.25	21.36	22.62	24.02	25.58	27.28	29.13	29.79	30.38	30.91	31.37	31.77	32.1	32.36	32.55	32.68
15	Senior Community Planner Senior Env. Resources Planner Environmental Engineer Restoration Biologist*	28.40	29.88	31.20	32.37	33.38	34.24	34.94	35.48	35.87	36.20	36.52	36.82	37.11	37.39	37.65	37.89	38.13	38.35
20	Division Director*	33.62	34.48	35.31	36.09	36.83	37.53	38.19	38.81	39.39	39.92	40.42	40.88	41.29	41.67	42.00	42.30	42.55	42.76
25	Deputy Director / Division Director**	37.88	38.78	39.63	40.44	41.21	41.94	42.62	43.26	43.86	44.42	44.94	45.41	45.84	46.23	46.58	46.88	47.15	47.36
27	Executive Director***	38.46	39.37	40.23	41.06	41.84	42.58	43.27	43.92	44.53	45.1	45.62	46.1	46.54	46.94	47.29	47.6	47.86	48.08

* Position not currently authorized; Division Director rates median of Ranges 15 and 25

** Position not analyzed in Study; proposed based on current compensation of Deputy Director/Division Director position (Step 17 rate is the current base rate of the DD/DD, which is 98.5% of Step 17 for ED; Step 0 determined by multiplying ED Step 0 by 98.5%; median rate placed at Step 6. Division Director max/min rates determined as median of max/min rates of positions above and below in the schedule; range median placed at Step 6)

*** Position contracted; hourly rate based on annual salary of \$80,000 to \$100,000, as determined by CARPC Budget & Personnel Panel (7/18/2007)

For Discussion Purposes Only

Annual Rates (effective Jan. 1, 2011 through Dec. 31, 2011)

Rg	Applicable Positions	Step																	
		0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
5	Planner	38,418	40,518	42,515	44,408	46,197	47,902	49,504	51,002	52,395	53,706	54,912	56,014	57,013	57,928	58,739	59,446	60,050	60,590
7	Administrative Services Manager	40,581	42,661	44,637	46,530	48,298	50,003	51,584	53,082	54,454	55,765	56,950	58,053	59,051	59,946	60,757	61,464	62,067	62,587
10	GIS Specialist Graphic Designer	38,418	40,123	42,120	44,429	47,050	49,962	53,206	56,742	60,590	61,963	63,190	64,293	65,250	66,082	66,768	67,309	67,704	67,974
15	Senior Community Planner Senior Env. Resources Planner Environmental Engineer Restoration Biologist*	59,072	62,150	64,896	67,330	69,430	71,219	72,675	73,798	74,610	75,296	75,962	76,586	77,189	77,771	78,312	78,811	79,310	79,768
20	Division Director*	69,930	71,718	73,445	75,067	76,606	78,062	79,435	80,725	81,931	83,034	84,074	85,030	85,883	86,674	87,360	87,984	88,504	88,941
25	Deputy Director / Division Director**	78,790	80,662	82,430	84,115	85,717	87,235	88,650	89,981	91,229	92,394	93,475	94,453	95,347	96,158	96,886	97,510	98,072	98,509
27	Executive Director***	79,997	81,890	83,678	85,405	87,027	88,566	90,002	91,354	92,622	93,808	94,890	95,888	96,803	97,635	98,363	99,008	99,549	100,006

* Position not currently authorized; Division Director rates median of Ranges 15 and 25

** Position not analyzed in Study; proposed based on current compensation of Deputy Director/Division Director position (Step 17 rate is the current base rate of the DD/DD, which is 98.5% of Step 17 for ED; Step 0 determined by multiplying ED Step 0 by 98.5%; median rate placed at Step 6. Division Director max/min rates determined as median of max/min rates of positions above and below in the schedule; range median placed at Step 6)

*** Position contracted; hourly rate based on annual salary of \$80,000 to \$100,000, as determined by CARPC Budget & Personnel Panel (7/18/2007)

Current CARPC Salary Schedule

Range	HOURLY										ANNUAL									
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J
M-5	18.48	19.39	20.33	21.29	22.32						38,438	40,331	42,286	44,283	46,426					
M-5-6	18.47	19.29	20.19	21.13	22.15	22.45	23.53				38,418	40,123	41,995	43,950	46,072	46,696	48,942			
M-5-9	18.47	19.29	20.19	21.13	22.15	24.19	25.35	26.58	27.86	29.18	38,418	40,123	41,995	43,950	46,072	50,315	52,728	55,286	57,949	60,694
M-6	19.52	20.44	21.42	22.45	23.53						40,602	42,515	44,554	46,696	48,942					
M-6-8	19.51	20.42	21.36	22.29	23.25	24.48	25.64	26.87			40,581	42,474	44,429	46,363	48,360	50,918	53,331	55,890		
M-7	20.71	21.71	22.76	23.82	24.97						43,077	45,157	47,341	49,546	51,938					
M-8	22.27	23.31	24.45	25.64	26.87						46,322	48,485	50,856	53,331	55,890					
M-9	24.19	25.35	26.57	27.86	29.18						50,315	52,728	55,266	57,949	60,694					
M-10	26.22	27.49	28.79	30.19	31.61						54,538	57,179	59,883	62,795	65,749					
M-11	28.40	29.77	30.74	32.65	34.24						59,072	61,922	63,939	67,912	71,219					
M-12	30.52	32.00	33.56	35.14	36.84						63,482	66,560	69,805	73,091	76,627					
M-13	32.87	34.46	36.10	37.87	39.66						68,370	71,677	75,088	78,770	82,493					
M-14	35.18	36.91	38.67	40.53	42.46						73,174	76,773	80,434	84,302	88,317					
M-15	37.64	39.46	41.35	43.33	45.41						78,291	82,077	86,008	90,126	94,453					
M-16	40.30	42.21	44.25	46.39	48.60						83,824	87,797	92,040	96,491	101,088					
M-17	43.13	45.20	47.36	49.62	52.03						89,710	94,016	98,509	103,210	108,222					
M-18	46.11	48.32	50.66	53.09	55.62						95,909	100,506	105,373	110,427	115,690					
M-19	49.36	51.72	54.22	56.79	59.52						102,669	107,578	112,778	118,123	123,802					
G-6	16.88	17.09	17.39	17.71	18.09						35,110	35,547	36,171	36,837	37,627					
G-7	17.09	17.39	17.71	18.09	18.39						35,547	36,171	36,837	37,627	38,251					
G-8	17.39	17.71	18.09	18.39	18.76						36,171	36,837	37,627	38,251	39,021					
G-9	17.71	18.09	18.39	18.76	19.17						36,837	37,627	38,251	39,021	39,874					
G-10	18.09	18.39	18.76	19.17	19.57						37,627	38,251	39,021	39,874	40,706					
G-11	18.39	18.76	19.17	19.57	19.99						38,251	39,021	39,874	40,706	41,579					
G-12	18.76	19.17	19.57	19.99	20.44						39,021	39,874	40,706	41,579	42,515					
G-13	19.17	19.57	19.99	20.44	20.90						39,874	40,706	41,579	42,515	43,472					
G-14	19.57	19.99	20.44	20.90	21.38						40,706	41,579	42,515	43,472	44,470					
G-15	19.99	20.44	20.90	21.38	21.86						41,579	42,515	43,472	44,470	45,469					
G-16	20.44	20.90	21.38	21.86	22.46						42,515	43,472	44,470	45,469	46,717					
G-17	20.90	21.38	21.86	22.46	23.01						43,472	44,470	45,469	46,717	47,861					
G-18	21.38	21.86	22.46	23.01	23.67						44,470	45,469	46,717	47,861	49,234					
G-19	21.86	22.46	23.01	23.67	24.35						45,469	46,717	47,861	49,234	50,648					
G-20	22.46	23.01	23.67	24.35	25.00						46,717	47,861	49,234	50,648	52,000					